

A Series of Questions & Answers Clarifying Doubts Around The Fitnah of Muḥammad Bin Hadī

with The Noble Shaykh Ḥasan ibn ‘Abd Al-Wahhāb Marzūq al-Bannā (حفظه الله)

Saturday 21st Dhūl-Hijjah 1439 | 1st September 2018

Question 3: Is It Incumbent On All The Students of Knowledge To Take A Position In The Fitnah of Muḥammad bin Hādī or Can They Remain Neutral?¹

Questioner: Is it incumbent on all the students of knowledge to take a position in this fitnah? Or is it okay for some to say they are not taking either Shaykh Rabī’s position or Shaykh Muḥammad bin Hādī? And should we abandon the one who has this speech?

Shaykh: We must clarify what is the most prevalent from what may be prevalent from the way of the scholars and from the best of the students of knowledge. Whoever, has brought the proofs forward then he is the one that is most prevalent. And there is no harm that you may come across a scholar that may make a mistake or may be correct because any man may make a mistake or may be correct. But, the clarification is built upon the person that has the proofs as it is with the case of Shaykh Rabī. Shaykh Rabī checked the proofs and went over them thoroughly and reviewed them with many scholars and we are comfortable ourselves with his proofs and the way he reaches his conclusion as well as all the people of intellect amongst the people of the Sunnah agree with him on that.

So, the scholars are the ones to say these matters and the most prevalent is the one we take with the proof. And it is not upon everybody to enter upon the

¹ Audio:

http://mpubs.org/HABA_20180901_is_it_incumbent_on_all_the_students_of_knowledge_to_take_a_position_in_the_fitnah_of_mbh_or_can_they_remain_neutral_ar_eng.mp3



subject matter because it is very highly likely that this person may not have enough knowledge may not even understand what he has just gotten into. Only the scholars and the best of the students of knowledge are the ones that have the ability and the capability to delve in such matters. As for those that have deficiencies in knowledge, would never reach a conclusion.

Questioner: So, it is upon us brothers here to be upon following the scholars or not?

Shaykh Ḥasan: Of course, it is upon you to follow the scholars and act upon what they say. And this is actually compulsory on those who cannot come to a conclusion or those that do not understand the matter.

Shaykh: If Shaykh Rabī told you to do such and such, then what would you do? I said I would do it.

Shaykh Ḥasan: Why? because Shaykh Rabī is a specialist in the science, the science of Jarḥ wa Ta'dīl. So, if he is telling you something in that science then **you must abide by that**, even though there might be a possibility that any Shaykh may make a mistake as well as be correct. But, yet when the proof is in his favour then we must take upon what he says.

And all of this that is happening according to my understanding and my understanding of course is according to my capabilities, because people have not got themselves used to being upon obedience and respect.

You live in a society, where the slogans for freedom of speech, freedom of the press and all of these false statements that lead you were? To make the people exit or keep themselves away from sticking to the guidelines of the Sunnah except those whom Allāh has given the success and Īmān has entered into their hearts. Just like what they say in Europe and United States, everybody can say whatever they want, and everybody is free, that is not the way of the religion of Allāh. This is why, it is difficult upon those to stick to the



statements of the scholars. This is why, it is difficult upon those that live in the West, for the most part, to stick to the statements of the scholars.

And this is what Allāh has praised the believers with, as He said about them in the Qur’ān,

وَقَالُوا سَمِعْنَا وَأَطَعْنَا غُفْرَانَكَ رَبَّنَا وَإِلَيْكَ الْمَصِيرُ

‘And they say, ‘We hear. And we obey. We seek Your forgiveness, our Lord, and to You is the return (of all)’ (Sūrah Al-Baqarah 2:285)

This is why, the believers in previous times were given mastery over the earth and their nations became the best of nations on the face of this earth. And the dunyā around them and the whole world was organised according to the Sunnah of Muḥammad (sallAllāhu ‘alayhi wa sallam), because of them following the religion of Allāh upon the face of the earth. Because everything was organised, this is the way of the believers that they have an organisation and have a system that everything in their lives is done in accordance with the Sunnah of Muḥammad (sallAllāhu ‘alayhi wa sallam) and the guidelines of the religion of Allāh.

It is not a chaotic reason here, like those that live out in the desert and have no military or no government, no police, nothing that would organize them. But, those amongst the believers that Allāh has given the victory like the Rightly Guided Caliphs and may Allāh be pleased with them after our Prophet Muḥammad (sallAllāhu ‘alayhi wa sallam), followed by the Abbasid dynasty, then the Muslims started getting weaker afterwards due to lack of following.

Questioner: What is your advice for those who are not on the side of Shaykh Muḥammad bin Hādī or Shaykh Rabī’?

Shaykh: So, how are we going to get a ruling on this matter? How are we going to have a decisive side in this case? Are you telling me that all the scholars could not come up with one opinion verses the other so, the case would be decisive, does this make any sense to you? This only means, the one that is



telling you this, is that they have deficiencies of their own by taking such neutral positions.

Questioner: And should we abandon the one who has this speech?

Shaykh: These people are those that are hung up in the middle, they are weak. They cannot solve a problem by saying what they are saying. You must advise them and tell them be firm and say don't you trust our Shaykh, Shaykh Rabī' ? Isn't he the Imām of Jarḥ wa Ta'dīl. You must let matters keep on going and you must stick to the opinions of the major scholars, so the fitnah can quiet down, so you would kill the fitnah by sticking to the opinions of the major scholars.

